

**MINUTES OF THE CHRISHALL EXTRAORDINARY PARISH COUNCIL
MEETING**

**Held on Wednesday, 25th July 2018 at 7.30pm in the
South Hall, New Village Hall, Crawley End, Chrishall.**

PRESENT: Cllr Derek Ailes (chairman), Cllr Steven Parish, Cllr Tracey Slade, Cllr David Thomas, Cllr John Kay, Cllr Sheena Lashko.

Clerk: Belinda Irons

PUBLIC: 0

18.102 Apologies for absence: Cllr Ian Pitfield, Cllr Jane Holloway, Cllr Stephen Foote.

18.103 Other absences: Members absent without offering apologies.

18.104 Declaration of Members Interests:
(disclosable pecuniary/pecuniary/non-pecuniary)
Cllr Kay Village Hall: Parish Council representative

The Chairman changed the running order of the meeting and put the next item to the end of the meeting

18.105 Public Discussion: limited to 15 minutes: no public present

18.106 Resignation of Chairman: update:
Cllr Ailes will resign as a Councillor and Chairman at the 4th September meeting. Cllr Ailes will produce a statement which he wishes to be entered in full into the minutes explaining why he has taken this decision. Cllr Thomas will take over on the 5th September.

PROPOSAL: *That Cllr David Thomas be elected as Chairman of Chrishall Parish Council from 5th September 2018.* PROPOSED: Cllr Ailes, seconded Cllr Kay. AGREED AND RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY

18.107 Planning: Cllr Ailes

UTT/18/1822/OP 62 High Street
Outline application with all matters reserved for the demolition of the existing garage and development of up to 2 dwelling houses: by 24th August:
Objection: overdevelopment/ agricultural land

UTT/18/1721/FUL Former Piggeries Chrishall Grange Road
Demolition of existing building and erection of 1 no. new dwelling with detached garage and new farm access

Chairman's signature..... 4th September 2018

Decision awaited

- UTT/18/1248/HHF Camps Cottage Broad Green
Convert existing garage annexe into living
accommodation for elderly mother
Permission granted
- UTT/18/1430/HHF The Meads, Bilden End
Single storey rear extension
Permission granted
- UTT/18/0783/HHF Broad Green Stables, Broad Green
Alterations and extension to existing out-building
and conversion to annexe for family member:
Permission granted

Stansted Airport:

UTT/17/1640/SO Scoping Option under Town and Country Planning
Act (Environmental Impact Assessment) Regulations 2017: proposed
increase in annual passenger numbers to 44.5 million. Cllr Thomas
said he would be attending a meeting called by SSE on the 26th July.

*The Chairman changed the running order of the meeting and moved
the Robert Reed Hall item towards the end of the meeting*

18.109 Finance

Bank Signatories: discussion: The Clerk advised the meeting that
following a telephone conversation with the bank, previous Parish
Councillors remain as signatories despite the Clerk and the Chairman
attending the bank and completing all forms in the presence of a bank
official some years ago. The Clerk will attend the bank with two of the
former Councillors who remain as bank signatories to pay via a BACS
transfer for the roofing works.

A new mandate form will be presented to a suitable meeting for
completion.

Finance Summary:

Year End Balances:

Balance Brought Forward:	£38,032.59
Plus income April	£15,800.00
Less expenditure April	£7,795.74
TOTAL:	£46,036.85

Balance Brought Forward:	£46,036.85
Plus income May	£2,971.00
Less expenditure May	£1,928.75

Chairman's signature..... 4th September 2018

TOTAL:	£47,029.10
Balance Brought Forward:	£47,029.10
Plus income June	£3,068.74
Less expenditure June	£4,544.46
TOTAL:	£45,553.38

Year End & Audit: Accounts open for inspection 2nd July.
All documents submitted to PKF Littlejohn for external audit to take place

18.108 Robert Reed Hall: roof replacement: update:

Internal works: discussion/ decision:

The Chairman said he would review the process which had been undertaken so far, and again provided Councillors with documents previously supplied detailing work programmes and financial forecasts. He commented that he had been the director of a multi-billion pound company and had been the chief executive of weak companies and specialised in 'turning them around'. His aim had been to do the same with the Parish Council. He had created assets such as Jigneys Meadow. He had never been treated the way he has recently.

On the 29th March, the school advised him of the leak in the roof. No minutes of any meeting made him responsible. He has always taken a management role and presented documents to the April meeting which were budgeting costs should the Parish Council be required to pay for all works.

The Chairman commented that he obtained an asbestos removal quote for the ceilings in the whole building and did receive comparative quotes following a complaint from Cllr Holloway that he had not obtained three quotes. These quotes were more expensive than Inspectas at £4,000 and £6,000 respectively. The Chairman stated that neither company could carry out the work until August.

The Chairman commented that he personally assisted Richard Burns the electrician to remove the existing light fittings on a Saturday morning prior to the removal of the ceilings by Inspectas, and also provided a taxi service as Richard Burns was unable to drive at that time. The minutes state that Richard Burns is the Parish Council electrician. The Chairman stated he had clarified with Uttlesford District Council that emergency works did not require three quotes. He had checked that everything he did was legal.

The Chairman had asked Richard Burns how much it would cost to refit the old lights. Richard Burns was stated as saying £300. The Chairman increased this cost to £400 as Richard Burns would be required to be present when the plasterers put up the new ceiling as directed by Mike Dearman. Mike Dearman had been appointed by the Chairman to

oversee the works and the Parish Council was advised of this appointment by email dated 13.7.18:

Good afternoon,

Yesterday I had a meeting with Mike Dearman who it has been agreed will take the responsibility for the Robert Reed Hall repair etc.

Attached is a summary of our conversation about timing and suppliers.

These timing and the related suppliers have been approved at council meetings over the last few months so there is nothing new. As you will see Mike has asked that he is the only one to contact the suppliers from now on to ensure there are no misunderstandings. This system worked when he was controlling the re-fit at the village hall.

If you have any question with the document could you come back to me. Mike has seen a copy of the document and has agreed it.

Subsequent to this meeting, the Clerk advised the Councillors that the roofing contractor would be on site to meet with the scaffolding company and work out what was needed. The Clerk suggested that Councillors may wish to take this opportunity to meet the contractor on the 9th July:

Dear Councillors

CLS has stated that now they have been advised by Derek they have go the work, Corry wants a site meeting today to discuss where the skip etc will go.

He has also said that he would like to start as soon as possible as the weather is likely to break and he wants to make a start and get as much done as possible.

Corry will be at the RRH between 12 an 1pm today.

If anyone can make it, please do attend so that you can meet Corry and understand any logistical problems he may have.

Jane has asked School if an earlier start would be possible provided all safety aspects are covered.

*Regards
Belinda*

The Chairman commented that it would be difficult to get three quotes for the small sums of money involved in the ceiling works. He asked how many qualified electricians would come out for £300? The Chairman commented he has been criticised by the Clerk for not

getting three quotes. He expects a full apology from the Clerk at the end of the meeting.

With regard to regulations, people won't quote for a small amount of money. It won't happen.

Cllr Parish commented that the situation had changed when the Chairman emailed he was not going to be involved with the roof anymore. See email below dated 14.7.18:

Dear Councillors,

This morning at 10.13am I received the email from Mike Dearman which is below. I think it is self explanatory. When Mike sent this email he was not aware I was resigning as well.

I would suggest you all advise Belinda who would like to take on the roll of overseeing the refit at Robert Reed Hall. I have promised my wife I will not be doing it!

Over to you!

Derek

Cllrs Parish and Thomas with the support of Cllr Holloway had met and reviewed the building and the recommendations and found shortfalls in the work programme which needed to be addressed. An assumption had been made that the old lights would be refitted. However, the wiring is at least 40 years old, the fittings are an unknown age but at least 20 years old, and there is risk associated with old electrical products.

The Chairman commented Richard Burns had confirmed the wiring was ok. Cllr Parish responded that the group now managing the project had a different view. Cllr Parish further commented that a formal decision relating to the ceiling works had not been made.

The Chairman commented that the Parish Council was now paying 'top wack' for everything when most of the village don't have children at the school. The Chairman commented that a rough quote was obtained and you won't get an electrician for that quote.

The Chairman commented that with regard to plasterboard, he has spoken to Richard Smith who had said it would cost about £1,200. The Chairman rang builders but no one was interested in the work. Mike Dearman had suggested the plasterers should get the plasterboard. The plasterers had worked locally at a number of properties. The Chairman commented that he had rung other plasterers but they were not interested in quoting.

The figure relating to decoration was an estimate created by the Chairman, as was the floor, in order to put 'something' in for these costs.

The Chairman commented that he never advised the Council that he had obtained three quotes. The figures provided were a budgetary exercise so that everyone had an idea of the money involved.

Cllr Kay commented that the roofing quotes had 20-year insurance backed warranties. The Chairman commented that he had not wanted CLS.

The Chairman distributed a section taken from the minutes with two parts detailing that the Clerk and other Councillors would undertake works. He stated the Clerk had not sought four quotes, and that the Clerk had not read the minutes which stated a working party should be formed. The Chairman was not mentioned.

Cllr Parish commented that hard copy quotes had now been received from Wilby & Burnett with the postmark 19.7.18 received on the 20.7.18 but documents were dated May 18. It is unknown why they arrived now with no explanation. The Chairman commented that he had spoken to Wilby & Burnett and asked for their fees to be included in the pricing but had not received any documents. Cllr Parish commented that he was under the impression that the Chairman had advised Wilby & Burnett that the quotes were not now required. The Chairman pressed Cllr Parish to divulge the source of this information which Cllr Parish was not prepared to do. The Chairman took offence at Cllr Parish's comment and Cllr Parish apologised but the fact that three comprehensive quotes had been prepared but not received was concerning. The Chairman continued to take personal offence. Cllr Parish stated that if his comments were incorrect he apologised and retracted his comment. The Chairman continued to take offence and pressed Cllr Parish for a name, particularly if the information had been conveyed by a Councillor. Cllr Parish commented that he formally apologised for his comment and the Chairman accepted this apology. Cllr Parish formally retracted the comment made.

The Chairman handed out a document where Mike Dearman was named as managing the project. Mike Dearman was shown to be arranging decoration. Richard Burns was booked to do the electrics.

The Chairman stated he was 'bloody furious' to have nasty emails coming through – that he had never been asked to handle Robert Reed Hall.

The Chairman commented that neither Councillors or the Clerk had suggested any alternatives. There were no financial alternatives presented. There was 78 days between the first of the Chairman's budgetary guidance documents and the Clerk's emailed requests for

quotes. The Clerk failed to get additional roof quotes within the time frame. It was the Clerk's duty to provide documents to the Council.

The Chairman stated he was resigning from the Parish Council as he was upset with the sloping roof, and that the Parish Council was spending money it couldn't justify so he had to resign.

The Chairman then opened the meeting to Councillors for comment.

The Clerk responded that before the meeting was open for comment, she had a prepared document for distribution and consideration. The Clerk further commented that this was an issue about procedure and there was no personal element to any comments. The Clerk apologised if the Chairman took the emails to be aggressive – these are shown for completeness below with the Chairman's responses dated 23.7.18:

You have my reply.

Derek

*From: Chishall Parish Council <chrishallpc@xlninternet.co.uk>
Date: Monday, 23 July 2018 10:49
To
Subject: RE: Chrishall*

Dear Derek

As you have refused to provide me with the quotes, can you please advise me who the contractors were that you contacted so that I can go direct and get copy quotes please?

*Regards
Belinda*

*From: Derek Ailes
Sent: 23 July 2018 09:49
To: Chishall Parish Council <chrishallpc@xlninternet.co.uk>;
Subject: Re: Chrishall*

No.

I will be at the meeting on Wednesday!

Derek

*From: Chishall Parish Council <chrishallpc@xlninternet.co.uk>
Date: Monday, 23 July 2018 09:18
To: Derek Ailes
Subject: RE: Chrishall*

*Dear Derek
Many thanks to your response to Councillors, but can I please have the quotes requested.
Regards
Belinda*

*From: Derek Ailes
Sent: 23 July 2018 09:09
To: Chishall Parish Council <chrishallpc@xlninternet.co.uk>;
Subject: Re: Chrishall
Importance: High*

*Dear councillors,

As I said in my last email I will answer any questions you might have.*

Derek

From: DEREK AILES

*From: Chishall Parish Council <chrishallpc@xlninternet.co.uk>
Date: Monday, 23 July 2018 07:18
To: Derek Ailes
Subject: RE: Chrishall*

*Dear Derek
Many thanks for sending this quote.*

What I am asking for are the other 2 quotes which are required to comply with our Financial Regulations which you stated you had got. I don't believe you ever stated where you had obtained these from in our meetings?

Also, the 3 quotes for the electrics, the plasterboard, the painting, the cleaning and the floor which would be required as the total job has been split down into elements rather than a whole job being done by one company.

Looking forward to receiving these documents as they are required for compliance with our Financial Regs and our audit requirements.

*Many thanks
Regards
Belinda*

*From: Derek Ailes
Sent: 22 July 2018 20:17
Cc: Chishall Parish Council <chrishallpc@xlninternet.co.uk>
Subject: FW: Chrishall*

Dear Councillors,

Belinda has asked me to send you the quotation from Ryan Plasterers.

I am forwarding you the email and quote dated 19th April from Ryan Plastering!

You will remember I made a presentation to the parish council at the May meeting in the Brand Pavilion giving quotations and price comparisons that I had obtained for most of the requirements to re-roof the pavilion. Copies of the individual quotations were made available at the meeting.

I hope you will remember the Parish Council on the meeting night specifically "thanked me for the all work I had done in obtaining quotes and making comparisons and for my presentation".

I will be happy to answer any questions you might have on Wednesday. I do not believe I have acted in any way outside my role as a councillor and chairman. I have acted within the Parish Council's Code of Conduct. I cannot see how any auditor could have a problem with my actions. I do not need lessons on sending emails from the parish clerk or be told how I should use my time!

The emails are shown below and the quotation as a word document above.

Looking forward to seeing you on Wednesday.

Regards

Derek

The Clerk apologised to Councillors present and commented that she had found it very difficult to guide Council as when she had attempted to do so in meetings, she had been shouted down and made to feel stupid. The Clerk further commented that she felt intimidated and bullied in the meetings by some Councillors when, for example, she had stated best practice would be to have sealed bids and this comment was ridiculed by the Chairman. The Clerk and Cllr Holloway had continuously sought a full written specification for all works. The Chairman had produced a 'brief' for the roofing works.

The Clerk commented that she had spoken with the Chairman outside the meetings and expressed her concerns regarding the management of the project. The Chairman responded that 'you just don't like the decision of the Council because it isn't the same as your decision'.

The Clerk commented that she had not sought other quotes because the Chairman had distributed the work load and then took control of it all over again.

The email trails show that it was only once the Chairman stated he would have nothing more to do with the process that Cllrs Holloway, Parish and Thomas with the Clerk felt able to follow correct procedure and the correct quotes have now been obtained.

The Clerk made application to UDC and obtained a grant of £3,500.

The Clerk also commented that she had sent out Financial Regulations, Standing Orders and the Good Councillor Guide to all Councillors and asked them to read the documentation. This was done in the hope that the Council would follow its own regulations.

The Clerk responded to the Chairman's assertion that she had been negligent in her duties as Clerk by failing to obtain four roofing quotes. The Clerk responded in the meeting that one contractor had attended site but failed to provide a quote when a 20-year insurance backed guarantee was required. A further contractor had simply failed to attend. The Clerk reiterated that the Chairman had 'taken over' tasks when they had been delegated. She felt unable to challenge the Chairman due to the Chairman's attitude towards this project.

The Clerk repeated that she apologised to the Council for failing to ensure compliance with Financial Regulations, but she felt unable to do so given the level of opposition she had received from some Councillors.

Councillors then took the opportunity to discuss the figures presented with a view to taking formal decisions. Quotes from the respective companies were present at the meeting for any Councillor to view. Discussion around repairing to the previous standard or improving the building were undertaken. The Clerk commented that the Parish Council had supported the Village Hall Committee when it provided sound attenuation measures to the new village halls. Small children make a significant level of noise and the building has no soft furnishings to mitigate. It would be more cost effective to deal with that issue now rather than retrofit.

The figures presented were discussed. Four different schemes were presented to the meeting by the Clerk, all supported with quotes. Cllr Kay commented that the cheapest quote needed to be used. This was the hybrid scheme of plasterboard and suspended ceiling with Richard Burns doing the electrics. The Clerk commented that it was only this scheme which bought the total works under the costing regulations requiring the works to be advertising in the European Union.

The Clerk commented that Cllr Parish needed to be thanked for his work on this project which included cutting back tree branches to ensure the scaffold could be erected and the works could be carried out unimpeded. Cllrs Parish, Thomas and Holloway have attended the site on numerous occasions with the Clerk to meet contractors and discuss options. The Clerk advised that when the ceiling was removed two 'upstands' over the windows in the main hall and the kitchen had been removed and there were additional repairs to be carried out which other Councillors would be unaware of. Also, that the bulk head lights had also been removed with the old ceiling. Richard Burns had recommended the use of LED lights as there was no guarantee the original lights would work if they were installed. The cladding to the south side over the windows was in urgent need of repair, but the materials needed careful consideration as this would influence what was used to replace the rest of the cladding around the building in the future. Only one quote had been obtained for the floor, and none for the painting. The Clerk had used a quote and calculated the cost out as a best estimate.

Cllr Thomas asked if the Parish Council owned the building and if so, could it be sold?

The Chairman responded that the Village Hall Committee always believed it owned the Robert Reed Hall and were always concerned about the roof and the ceiling. The Village Hall Committee wanted to change the constitution to get away from the building and its problems. In 1951 Mrs Langford sold land to Essex County Council for the school, and Essex County Council built the playground on the land Mrs Langford had gifted to the village for the village hall to be built on. In 1977/78 Essex County Council did a land exchange and the agreement was between Essex County Council and Chrishall Parish Council. The complication is the access road forms part of the original deed of gift to the village, and the road may remain under the ownership of the Village Hall Committee. This is currently under investigation. The Village Hall Committee never owned Robert Reed Hall and would therefore never have had the responsibility of the roof and ceiling. The roadway would be a complication if the building was sold. The building is attached to the school which would mean a very restricted market for it.

Cllr Kay commented the Parish Council would make a good profit from the building if it was let to school for 20 years, even taking out the expenditure due to be incurred.

Cllr Kay commented that the suspended/ plaster ceiling hybrid would enable access to the electrics should this be required.

PROPOSAL: That Chrishall Parish Council herewith appoints Hadham Ceilings to install a hybrid suspended ceiling system to the main and second halls, and plasterboard to the remaining areas in the sum of £2756 and Richard Burns is appointed to do the electrical installation in the sum of £2025 which includes

